



MEMORANDUM

OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL

September 27, 2012

TO: Ananth Prasad, P.E., Secretary

FROM: Robert E. Clift, Inspector General

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Robert E. Clift".

SUBJECT: Inwood Consulting Engineers, Inc. Selection Process - OIG Assignment No. 13C-6002

You requested we review Professional Services contracts awarded to Inwood Consulting Engineers, Inc. (Inwood) in Districts One (D1) and Five (D5) based on allegations received by the department. These anonymous complaints alleged department staff in both districts showed favoritism toward Inwood in the selection process of consultants. On March 28, 2012, an anonymous complainant alleged District One Project Management Engineer had a personal relationship with unidentified employees of Inwood, showed favoritism toward Inwood in the selection of Project Design Consultants and had recommended Inwood to the District Design Engineer in District Seven. The complaint was investigated by the OIG and closed due to lack of support for the allegations. On July 18, 2012, an anonymous complainant alleged the District Five design team and project management team shortlisted Inwood for Financial Project Number 432100-1-22-01 citing, "There are folks here who plan to go and work for Inwood soon and they are negotiating their salaries by how much work they can get for Inwood Consulting."

The purpose of our review was to determine whether Inwood was selected at a greater frequency than reasonable for professional service contracts in D1 and/or D5 and whether department employees who were involved in the selection of Inwood were now employed by them.

We reviewed Professional Services contracts awarded to Inwood for the period July 1, 2010 through September 1, 2012, and evaluated the consultant selection process in D1 and D5. We have also reviewed selection records and current status of Financial Project Number 432100-1-22-01.

The total dollar amount for D1 contracts awarded to Inwood was \$10,878,664 which represents 3.45 percent of total professional services contracts awarded in the district. Inwood was awarded a total of \$7,653,970 or 7.7 percent of contracts in D5 (See *Attachment A*). Our review showed Inwood was selected four out of 13 times it expressed interest in advertised projects for D1 and three out of 13 times for D5 (See *Attachment B*). Based on our analysis, the number of times Inwood was longlisted, shortlisted and selected for Professional Services Contracts appears to be reasonable.

A review of personnel records determined only two D1 Technical Review Committee (TRC) members had separated from the department. None of D5 TRC members left the department (*See Attachment C*). Out of Selection Committee Members, two left the department in both D1 and D5 (*See Attachment D*). Based on our research, none of the former department employees that were members of the committees are currently employed by Inwood. Our review of the employment status of the committee members did not identify any documented evidence supporting allegations the employees planned to secure employment with Inwood and negotiated salaries based on the amount of work awarded to Inwood. We have also reviewed department records related to the selection of Inwood and technical evaluation scores of each TRC member participating in the selection process. Our review of the records showed no instances of favoritism toward Inwood or any indication of an unfair selection process (*See Attachment E*).

Lastly, we reviewed current status of D5 Financial Project Number 432100-1-22-01. The results of final selection showed HNTB Corporation had the highest ranking while Inwood was ranked second. HNTB is currently negotiating Contract No. 13540 for the project. A review of TRC scores showed no appearance of favoritism toward Inwood (*See Attachment F*).

Based on our review, the consultant selection process in D1 and D5 does not appear to be influenced in Inwood's favor.

Attachment A

Professional Services Contracts Awarded to Inwood Consulting Engineers, Inc. Between July 1, 2010 and September 1, 2012

District 1

| Contract | Advertised Date | Long-list Date | Short-list Date | Final Selection Date | Execution Date | Original Amount | Current Amount |
|--|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------------|----------------|------------------------|------------------------|
| C9071 | 6/28/2010 | 7/14/2010 | 7/20/2010 | 9/7/2010 | 1/26/2011 | 3,549,332.00 | 3,637,483.00 |
| C9100 | 7/26/2010 | 8/17/2010 | 8/23/2010 | 10/26/2010 | 2/10/2011 | \$999,270.00 | \$999,270.00 |
| C9608 | 11/8/2011 | 12/1/2011 | 12/13/2011 | 2/7/2012 | 5/7/2012 | \$1,499,425.00 | \$1,499,425.00 |
| C9607 | 10/31/2011 | 11/29/2011 | 12/14/2011 | 2/7/2012 | 5/3/2012 | \$4,742,486.00 | 4,742,486.00 |
| TOTAL INWOOD CONTRACTS | | | | | | \$10,790,513.00 | \$10,878,664.00 |
| TOTAL D1 CONTRACTS | | | | | | | \$315,734,192 |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL D1 CONTRACTS | | | | | | | 3.45% |

District 5

| Contract | Advertised Date | Long-list Date | Short-list Date | Final Selection Date | Execution Date | Original Amount | Current Amount |
|--|-----------------|----------------|-----------------|----------------------|----------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| C9678 | 12/5/2011 | . | 1/17/2012 | 2/20/2012 | 6/8/2012 | \$3,053,305.00 | \$3,053,305.00 |
| C9719 | 1/3/2012 | . | 1/30/2012 | 3/5/2012 | 6/26/2012 | \$3,854,800.00 | \$3,854,800.00 |
| C9201 | 1/3/2011 | 1/24/2011 | 1/31/2011 | 3/7/2011 | 5/11/2011 | \$646,787.00 | \$745,865.00 |
| TOTAL INWOOD CONTRACTS | | | | | | \$7,554,892.00 | \$7,653,970.00 |
| TOTAL D5 CONTRACTS | | | | | | | \$99,457,171 |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL D5 CONTRACTS | | | | | | | 7.70% |

Note: No Design/Build contracts with a final selection date between July 1, 2010 and September 1, 2012, for Inwood Consulting Engineers, Inc. within District 1 and District 5.

Attachment B

Longlisted, Shortlisted and Selected Consultants on Professional Services Contracts

District 1

| | Letters of Response | No. Times Longlisted | No. Times Shortlisted | No. Times Selected |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|
| TOTAL COUNT | 786 | 710 | 261 | 62 |
| INWOOD | 13 | 13 | 7 | 4 |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF RESPONSE | | 100% | 53.85% | 30.77% |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL D1 | 1.65% | 1.83% | 2.68% | 6.45% |

District 5

| | Letters of Response | No. Times Longlisted | No. Times Shortlisted | No. Times Selected |
|-------------------------------|----------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|
| TOTAL COUNT | 888 | 689 | 345 | 89 |
| INWOOD | 13 | 12 | 5 | 3 |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF RESPONSE | | 92% | 38.46% | 23.08% |
| INWOOD PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL D5 | 1.46% | 1.74% | 1.45% | 3.37% |

Attachment C

Current Employment Status of Technical Review Committee Members as of 9/5/2012

District 1 – Contracts Awarded to Inwood

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|--|---|
| C9607 – Final Selection Date 2/7/2012 | |
| Melissa Grimes | Senior Design Engineer/Supervisor |
| Ryan Lazenby | Access Management Manager |
| Ray Porter | Project Manager |
| C9608 – Final Selection Date 2/7/2012 | |
| Marlon Bizerra | District Environmental Manager |
| Amy Perez | Systems Planning Administrator |
| Tony Sherrard | Project Manager |
| C9100 – Final Selection Date 10/26/2010 | |
| Ryan Lazenby | Access Management Manager |
| Chris Piazza | Rummel, Klepper & Kahl, LLP, separated from DOT 9/15/2011 |
| Gwen Pipkin | Project Manager |
| C9071 – Final Selection Date 9/7/2010 | |
| Jacob McClish | Parsons Brinkerhoff, separated from DOT 6/7/2012 |
| Mark Peronto | Assistant District Materials Engineer |
| Jamey Wooten | Project Manager |

District 5 – Contracts Awarded to Inwood

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|---|---|
| C9201 – Final Selection Date 3/7/2011 | |
| Brian Stanger, P.E. | District Environmental Mgt. Engineer |
| Susan Sadighi | Intermodal Systems Development Manager |
| Amy Sirmans, P.E. | CO-External Consultant |
| C9678 – Final Selection Date 2/20/2012 | |
| Gary Bass | Project Manager Supervisor |
| Mario Bizzio | District Program Manager |
| Todd Long, P.E. | Project Manager Supervisor |
| C9719 – Final Selection Date 3/5/2012 | |
| Todd Long, P.E. | District Design Engineer |
| Amir Asgarinik | Environmental Mgt. Office Project Manager |
| Ed Kestory, P.E. | District Environmental Mgt. Engineer |

District 5 – Financial Management Number 43210012201

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|--|---|
| C13540 – Final Selection Date 8/27/2012 | |
| Annette Brennan, P.E. | District Design Engineer |
| Mary McGehee | Environmental Mgt. Office Project Manager |
| Brian Stanger, P.E. | District Environmental Mgt. Engineer |

Attachment D

Current Employment Status of Selection Committee Members as of 9/10/2012

District 1 – Contracts Awarded to Inwood

| Selection Committee Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|--|---|
| C9607 – Final Selection Date 2/7/2012 | |
| B.L. Hattaway | District Secretary |
| E.J. Gonzalez | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| C.E. Smith | District Director of Transportation Development |
| C9608 – Final Selection Date 2/7/2012 | |
| B.L. Hattaway | District Secretary |
| E.J. Gonzalez | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| C.E. Smith | District Director of Transportation Development |
| C9100 – Final Selection Date 10/26/2010 | |
| S.M. Cann | Jacobs Engineering, separated from DOT 7/29/2011 |
| E.J. Gonzalez | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| D. Combs | Rummel, Klepper & Kahl, LLP, separated from DOT 9/15/2011 |
| C.J. Finn | District Transportation Support Manager |
| J. Limbaugh | District Director of SWAO |
| C9071 – Final Selection Date 9/7/2010 | |
| S.M. Cann | Jacobs Engineering, separated from DOT 7/29/2011 |
| E.J. Gonzalez | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| D. Combs | Rummel, Klepper & Kahl, LLP, separated from DOT 9/15/2011 |
| C.J. Finn | District Transportation Support Manager |
| J. Limbaugh | District Director of SWAO |

District 5 – Contracts Awarded to Inwood

| Selection Committee Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|--|---|
| C9201 – Final Selection Date 3/7/2011 | |
| Noranne B. Downs, P.E. | District Secretary |
| Alan E. Hyman, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| George S. Lovett | District Director of Transportation Development |
| Rise' K. Wall | Unknown, retired from DOT 4/12/2012 |
| Frank J. O'Dea, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Development |
| C9678 – Final Selection Date 2/20/2012 | |
| Noranne B. Downs, P.E. | District Secretary |

| | |
|--|--|
| Alan E. Hyman, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| Frank J. O'Dea, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Development |
| Ed Hensel | Unknown, separated from DOT 2/14/2012 (relocated to Maine) |
| C9719 – Final Selection Date 3/5/2012 | |
| Noranne B. Downs, P.E. | District Secretary |
| Alan E. Hyman, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| Frank J. O'Dea, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Development |
| Todd Hammerle, P.E. | District Maintenance Engineer |

District 5 – Financial Management Number 43210012201

| Selection Committee Member Name (by Contract) | Current Employment Status |
|--|---|
| C13540 – Final Selection Date 8/27/2012 | |
| Noranne B. Downs, P.E. | District Secretary |
| Frank J. O'Dea, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Development |
| Alan E. Hyman, P.E. | District Director of Transportation Operations |
| Lorie A. Matthews | District Transportation Support Manager |

Attachment E

Technical Review Committee Evaluation Scores

District 1

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Shortlisted Consultant Firms Scores | | |
|--|--|------------------------------|---------------------------|
| C9607 | Inwood Consulting | ICON | Atkins |
| Melissa Grimes | 90 | 79 | 88 |
| Ryan Lazenby | 79 | 59 | 74 |
| Ray Porter | 88 | 83 | 90 |
| C9608 | Inwood Consulting | H.W. Lochner | Jacobs Engineering |
| Marlon Bizerra | 86 | 85 | 84 |
| Amy Perez | 91 | 87 | 89 |
| Tony Sherrard | 93 | 92 | 91 |
| C9100 | Inwood Consulting | Jacobs Engineering | Transystem |
| Ryan Lazenby | 93 | 89 | 90 |
| Chris Piazza | 91 | 82 | 85 |
| Gwen Pipkin | 98 | 95 | 96 |
| C9071 | Inwood Consulting | Parsons Transporation | Volkert |
| Jacob McClish | 93 | 87 | 92 |
| Mark Peronto | 96 | 92 | 95 |
| Jamey Wooten | 95 | 86 | 98 |

District 5 - Contracts Awarded to Inwood

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Shortlisted Consultant Firms Scores | | |
|--|--|-----------------------|------------------|
| C9201 | Inwood Consulting | Kimley-Horn | Kittleson |
| Brian Stanger, P.E. | 93 | 86 | 90 |
| Susan Sadighi | 93 | 89 | 96 |
| Amy Sirmans, P.E. | 96 | 92 | 94 |
| C9678 | Inwood Consulting | Parsons | CDM Smith |
| Gary Bass | 95 | 93 | 86 |
| Mario Bizzio | 99 | 90 | 86 |
| Todd Long, P.E. | 90 | 90 | 82 |
| C9719 | Inwood Consulting | Kisinger Campo | Lochrane |
| Todd Long, P.E. | 92 | 94 | 87 |

| | | | |
|------------------|----|----|----|
| Amir Asgarinik | 89 | 83 | 86 |
| Ed Kestory, P.E. | 89 | 83 | 84 |

District 5 – Financial Management Number 43210012201

| TRC Member Name (by Contract) | Shortlisted Consultant Firms Scores | | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------|-------------|
| | C13540 | Inwood Consulting | HNTB |
| Annette Brennan, P.E. | 84 | 92 | 83 |
| Mary McGehee | 93 | 95 | 90 |
| Brian Stanger, P.E. | 90 | 93 | 89 |

Attachment F

Current Status of Financial Management Project Number 43210012201

DISTRICT 5

Financial Management Number(s):

43210012201

Project Description :

I4 FM POLK/OSC CL TO W OF KIRK

| | | | |
|---|-------------|--------------|---------|
| Longlist(Tech. Rev. Cate.) Date: | 10JUL2012 | Time: | 01:00PM |
| Shortlist Selection Date | : 16JUL2012 | Time: | 08:15AM |
| Shortlist Selection Posting | : 16JUL2012 | | |
| Scope Meeting Date | : 19JUL2012 | Time: | 02:00PM |
| Final Selection Meeting Date | : 27AUG2012 | Time: | 08:15AM |
| Final Selection Posting Date | : 27AUG2012 | | |
| 1st Negotiations Meeting | : 06SEP2012 | Time: | 01:00PM |
| 2nd Negotiations Meeting | : 17SEP2012 | Time: | 08:30AM |
| 3rd Negotiations Meeting | : 24SEP2012 | Time: | 08:30AM |
| 4th Negotiations Meeting | : 27SEP2012 | Time: | 01:30PM |

Rank Consultant

| | |
|---|-----------------------------------|
| 1 | HNTB CORPORATION |
| 2 | INWOOD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, INC. |
| 3 | CH2M HILL, INC. |