

Minutes for I-4 Ultimate Short-List Meeting of May 21, 2013

Attached, for informational purposes only, are the Florida Department of Transportation's meeting minutes for the I-4 Ultimate Short-List meeting that took place on May 21, 2013.

Although the Department properly noticed the Short-List meeting, the meeting was open to the public, and minutes were taken in compliance with the Sunshine Law, a request to record the meeting was not accommodated; therefore, the Department will be holding another Short-List meeting on June 5, 2013 at 10:00 am in order to accommodate any person who would like to record the meeting.

No effective decision resulted from the May 21, 2013 meeting. At the June 5, 2013 meeting the Project Selection Committee will make all Short-List decisions regarding the I-4 Ultimate Project.



**I-4 Ultimate Project Selection Committee Short-List Meeting
Minutes
Tuesday, May 21, 2013
1:00 pm
FDOT Orlando Urban Office – 133 S Semoran Blvd, Orlando, FL 32807**

1. The Short-List Meeting of the Project Selection Committee was called to order by Frank O’Dea at 1:02 pm. 75 people signed in.
2. Frank O’Dea went through a presentation that described the project, the proposer teams and Statement of Qualifications Evaluation Process, including the steps that the Technical, Financial and Administrative Expert Panels and Scorers went through to get to the Short-List Meeting.
3. Clarification Points: The Financial Expert Panel made clarifications to their consensus comments for the 4wardPartners and I-4 Mobility Partners teams. The Technical Expert Panel made a clarification to their consensus comments for the I-4 Ultimate Mobility Partners team. At the meeting revised versions of the consensus comments, marked to show changes, were provided to the technical and financial scorers for their review.

The Scorers reviewed the clarified consensus comments, their original score sheets and the portions of the Statements of Qualifications related to the clarified consensus comments. No Scorer changed their scores or comments after performing this review.

4. Frank O’Dea continued with the meeting once it was confirmed that no changes were made to the scores after the clarifications were made.
5. The pass/fail recommendations from the Scorers were given to the Project Selection Committee and posted on the screen for viewing by those in attendance. The Project Selection Committee reviewed the pass/fail scores and determined that the Statements of Qualifications of I-4 Mobility Partners failed to meet the requirements of the Request for Qualifications.

Proposer Teams	Technical Pass/fail: Technical Scoring Committee	Financial Pass/Fail: Financial Scoring Committee	Administrative Pass/Fail: Administrative Scoring Committee	Overall Pass/Fail
4wardPartners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Development Partners LLC	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Ultimate Mobility Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Mobility Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Ultimate Mobility Partners	Fail*	Fail	Pass	Fail
I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass

* 2 Scorers failed, 1 Scorer passed

6. The weightings for the Financial criteria, Technical criteria and the numerical equivalents for the adjectival scores were set before the receipt of the Statements of Qualifications and kept in sealed envelopes. After the pass/fail determination, these sealed envelopes were presented by Noranne Downs to Frank O’Dea who gave them to Michelle Sloan to be entered into the master score spreadsheet.



7. At this point, the Average of Recommended Scores was presented to the Project Selection Committee and posted on the screen for viewing by those in attendance.

SCORING OVERVIEW
Average of Recommended Scores

Possible Max. Score	4wardPartners	I-4 Development Partners LLC	Ultimate Mobility Partners	I-4 Mobility Partners	I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC
Overall Recommended SOQ Score (100 Max. Points)						
100.00	71.49	75.26	66.08	76.39	64.23	63.09
Component 1: Technical Qualifications and Capability (40 Maximum Points)						
40.00	34.33	32.00	36.73	34.73	24.20	26.67
Component 2: Statement of Technical and Subcontracting Approach (10 Maximum Points)						
10.00	8.20	7.93	6.93	5.90	6.87	6.80
Component 3: Financial Qualifications and Capacity (45 Maximum Points)						
45.00	25.54	31.63	20.50	33.29	30.67	26.38
Component 4: Statement of Financial Approach (5 Maximum Points)						
5.00	3.42	3.70	1.92	2.47	2.50	3.25

The Overall Ranking was also presented to the Project Selection Committee and also was posted on the screen for viewing by those in attendance.

Overall Ranking (Max 100 Points)		
Rank	Team	Score
1	I-4 Mobility Partners	76.39
2	I-4 Development Partners LLC	75.26
3	4wardPartners	71.49
4	Ultimate Mobility Partners	66.08
5	I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	64.23
6	4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC	63.09

The Project Selection Committee (Noranne Downs, Alan Hyman, Gerry O'Reilly) discussed the results from the scores and asked some of the scorers clarifying questions. The Project Selection Committee then made a decision to short-list the top four ranked teams.

- 4wardPartners
- I-4 Development Partners LLC
- I-4 Mobility Partners
- Ultimate Mobility Partners

8. Meeting ended by Frank O'Dea at 2:02 pm.

I-4 Ultimate Project

Project Selection Committee Briefing



Briefing Overview

- Description of Project
- Composition of Proposer Teams
 - 4wardPartners
 - I-4 Development Partners LLC
 - Ultimate Mobility Partners
 - I-4 Mobility Partners
 - I-4 Ultimate Mobility Partners
 - I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners
 - 4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC
- Procurement Schedule
- Summary of Procurement Process
- Presentation of Pass/Fail Recommendations
 - Financial, Technical & Administrative
- Summary of SOQ Recommendations
- Discussion & Short-Listing Determination



Description of Project

Public-private partnership between FDOT and a concessionaire to:

- Design, build, finance, operate, and maintain the I-4 Ultimate Project through a Concession Agreement.
- Reconstruct and widen the I-4 to accommodate 3 general use lanes, auxiliary lanes, and 2 managed lanes in each direction.
- Reconstruct or build 19 interchanges and replace or construct over 100 bridges.

3

Composition of Proposer Teams

4wardPartners

- **Equity Members**
 - VINCI Concessions S.A.S. (42.5%)
 - Meridiam Infrastructure I-4 Ultimate, LLC (42.5%)
 - Walsh Investors, LLC (15%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - Archer Western-Hubbard-de Moya Joint Venture (Archer Western Contractors, LLC; Hubbard Construction Company; and The de Moya Group, Inc.)
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - AECOM Technical Services, Inc.
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - 4wardPartners (VINCI Concessions S.A.S.; Meridiam Infrastructure I-4 Ultimate, LLC; and Walsh Investors, LLC)

4

Composition of Proposer Teams

I-4 Development Partners LLC

- **Equity Members**
 - Macquarie Capital Group Limited (40%)
 - OHL Concesiones S.A. (40%)
 - FCC Construccion S.A. (20%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - A team comprised of Obrascon Huarte Lain, S.A.; Community Asphalt Corp.; and FCC Construccion, S.A.
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - HNTB Corporation
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - A team comprised of Macquarie Capital Group Limited; OHL Concesiones S.A.; and FCC Construccion S.A.

5

Composition of Proposer Teams

Ultimate Mobility Partners

- **Equity Members**
 - InfraRed Capital Partners Limited (70%)
 - Fluor Enterprises, Inc. (15%)
 - Kiewit Infrastructure South Co. (15%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - Ultimate Mobility Constructors (Fluor Enterprises, Inc. and Kiewit Infrastructure South Co.)
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - Parsons/Atkins (a JV of Parsons Transportation Group, Inc. and Atkins North America, Inc.)
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - Ultimate Mobility Operators (Fluor Enterprises, Inc. and DBi Services, LLC)

6

Composition of Proposer Teams

I-4 Mobility Partners

- **Equity Members**
 - Skanska Infrastructure Development Inc. (50%)
 - John Laing Investments Limited (50%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - Skanska-Granite-Lane Joint Venture (Skanska USA Civil Southeast Inc.; Granite Construction Company; and The Lane Construction Corporation)
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - HDR/Jacobs Design Joint Venture (HDR Engineering, Inc. and Jacobs Engineering Group, Inc.)
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - Infrastructure Corporation of America

7

Composition of Proposer Teams

I-4 Ultimate Mobility Partners

- **Equity Members**
 - Cintra Infraestructuras, S.A. (100%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - A design-build JV of Ferrovial Agroman, S.A. and MCM
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - A JV of The Louis Berger Group, Inc. and Lockwood, Andrews & Newnam, Inc.
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - Cintra Infraestructuras, S.A.

8

Composition of Proposer Teams

I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners

- **Equity Members**
 - Odebrecht Roadway Investments Corporation (25%)
 - Samsung E&C America, Inc. (25%)
 - Bilfinger Project Investments International Holding GmbH (25%)
 - Balfour Beatty Investments, Inc. (25%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - A team comprised of Odebrecht Construction, Inc.; Zachry Construction Corporation; and Samsung E&C America, Inc.
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - Parsons Brinckerhoff, Inc.
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - Transfield Services Infrastructure, Inc.

9

Composition of Proposer Teams

4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC

- **Equity Members**
 - ACS Infrastructure Development, Inc. (40%)
 - Teachers Insurance and Annuity Association of America (40%)
 - Shikun & Binui Ltd. (20%)
- **Lead Contractor**
 - A construction JV of Dragados USA, Inc. and Shikun & Binui Ltd.
- **Lead Engineering Firm**
 - Lochner MMM Group, LLC (JV of H.W. Lochner, Inc. and MMM Group Limited)
- **Lead Operations and Maintenance Firm**
 - Roy Jorgensen Associates, Inc.

10

Procurement Schedule

Two Phase Procurement

- **Request for Qualifications**
 - Released - March 8, 2013
 - Statements of Qualifications Received - April 19, 2013
 - Short-list Proposers Based on SOQs - May 21, 2013
- **Request for Proposals**
 - Release Final RFP – September 2013
 - Proposals Due – January 2014
 - Evaluation of Proposals – January ~ March 2014
 - Selection of a “Best Value Proposal” – March 2014
 - Award and Execution - June 2014

11

Summary of Procurement Process

SOQ Evaluation Process – Part I

- Leon Corbett sets the weighting of financial evaluation criteria
- Frank O’Dea sets the weighting of technical evaluation criteria and the numerical equivalents for the adjectival scores
- Procurement office receives and logs SOQs
- Financial, Technical and Pass/Fail Expert Panels develop consensus comments following the RFQ evaluation criteria
- Expert Panel members meet with Scoring Committee members individually to present their analysis

12

Summary of Procurement Process

SOQ Evaluation Process – Part II

- Scoring Committee members score SOQs and perform pass/fail determination on an individual basis
- Scoring Committee members submit scores and pass/fail recommendations to Procurement office
- Public Meeting
 - Procurement office converts adjectival scores using predetermined weightings and numerical equivalents
 - Project Selection Committee makes short-listing decision (or elects to defer until another public meeting)

13

Clarification of Expert Panels' Consensus Comments



14

Presentation of Pass/Fail Recommendations

- Financial
- Technical
- Administrative



15

Presentation of Pass/Fail Recommendations

Summary of SOQ Pass/Fail Recommendations

Proposer Teams	Technical Pass/fail: Technical Scoring Committee	Financial Pass/Fail: Financial Scoring Committee	Administrative Pass/Fail: Administrative Scoring Committee	Overall Pass/Fail
4wardPartners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Development Partners LLC	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
Ultimate Mobility Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Mobility Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
I-4 Ultimate Mobility Partners	Fail*	Fail	Pass	Fail
I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass
4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC	Pass	Pass	Pass	Pass

* 2 Scorers failed, 1 Scorer passed

16

Summary of SOQ Recommendations



17

Opening of Weightings and Numerical Equivalents



18

Summary of SOQ Scoring Recommendations

**To be inserted
During Public Meeting**

19

Proposer Ranking Recommendations

**To be inserted
During Public Meeting**

20

Project Selection Committee

Discussion & Short-Listing Determination

21

Summary of SOQ Scoring Recommendations

Possible Max. Score	4wardPartners	I-4 Development Partners LLC	Ultimate Mobility Partners	I-4 Mobility Partners	I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC
Overall Recommended SOQ Score (100 Max. Points)						
100.00	71.49	75.26	66.08	76.39	64.23	63.09
Component 1: Technical Qualifications and Capability (40 Maximum Points)						
40.00	34.33	32.00	36.73	34.73	24.20	26.67
Component 2: Statement of Technical and Subcontracting Approach (10 Maximum Points)						
10.00	8.20	7.93	6.93	5.90	6.87	6.80
Component 3: Financial Qualifications and Capacity (45 Maximum Points)						
45.00	25.54	31.63	20.50	33.29	30.67	26.38
Component 4: Statement of Financial Approach (5 Maximum Points)						
5.00	3.42	3.70	1.92	2.47	2.50	3.25

Proposer Ranking Recommendations

Overall Ranking (Max 100 Points)		
Rank	Team	Score
1	I-4 Mobility Partners	76.39
2	I-4 Development Partners LLC	75.26
3	4wardPartners	71.49
4	Ultimate Mobility Partners	66.08
5	I-4 Ultimate Expressway Partners	64.23
6	4ward Express ProposerCo, LLC	63.09

20

Project Selection Committee

**Discussion
&
Short-Listing Determination**

21

I-4 Ultimate Short-list Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, May 21, 2013 at 1:00pm
Orlando Urban Office – 133 S Semoran Blvd, Orlando, FL

NAME
Mauricio Gonzalez
Stephen Jones
GARY KUHUS
EJAZ AITMAD
Yvonne McClain
George Gilhooly
Kristof Van Loon
Keith Brockman
VIPIN C MEHTA
Gmy Davies
WALT JOHNSON
Katherine Beck
Tom Stoner
Laurie Boggs
JIM STROZ
REY RIVAS
Tom Vinding
Greg Aldrich
JAVIER DE JUAN
Roger Kramer
Regina Renfield
Jennifer Brockman
SARA HENNINGSGAARD
KEVIN HOEFLICH
April Heller
Dave Mixon
JUAN MIGUEL PÉREZ

I-4 Ultimate Short-list Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, May 21, 2013 at 1:00pm
Orlando Urban Office – 133 S Semoran Blvd, Orlando, FL

NAME

Carol Finn

JOE KOWALSKI

Julie Adamson

CHARLEY WILLIAMS / Gec

Dennis Balthus

Kelly Eger-Smith / American Environmental Consulting

Charlie Humphries Johnson Bros -

Amy Seales FDOT

Annette Brennan FDOT

PETE PIERSON EISSOLD & RUSSO

Rick Morrow FDOT

JANE MOYAR / ANC

John Paulson / PB

Tom Kelley - Pogonos Engineering LLC

Melody Green Weatherbee Construction

RJ. Norton Weatherbee " "

John Tyler, FDOT

CHRISTINA CROOK ALMANZAR, JOHNSON BROS.

Rick Crooks, ETAC Consulting, Inc.

Loreen Bobo

Frank O'Pea

Noranne Downs

Gerry O'Reilly

Alan Hyman

Nicola Liguori

John Tyler

Todd Hammerle

I-4 Ultimate Short-list Selection Committee Meeting
Tuesday, May 21, 2013 at 1:00pm
Orlando Urban Office – 133 S Semoran Blvd, Orlando, FL

NAME	Kevin Cornish, AECOM
	PAUL E CURTIS