
CHAPTER 15

FINAL ESTIMATES PERFORMANCE REVIEWS

15.1 PURPOSE

Final Estimates (FE) Performance Reviews are conducted to verify compliance with Department policies and procedures. For the purpose of this chapter, FE performance reviews include Independent Assurance (IA) Reviews and Post Audit Reviews (PARs). IA Reviews are used to evaluate the performance of Final Estimates Level II qualified personnel in preparing Final Estimates Packages. PARs are used to assess the Final Estimates Package and financial documentation throughout the project. The PARs completed on most projects when a Final Estimate is certified and submitted to the appropriate District Final Estimates Office (DFEO).

15.2 AUTHORITY

Sections 20.23(3)(a) and 334.048(3), Florida Statutes (F.S.)

15.2.1 REFERENCES

Title 23 Code of Federal Regulations (CFR) 637, Quality Assurance Procedures for Construction

15.3 REVIEW PERSONNEL

Any person who performs IA Reviews and PARs must hold a current Final Estimate (FE) Level II qualification from the Construction Training Qualification Program (CTQP). Review personnel will be from the DFEO. Resident Offices will **NOT** perform IA Reviews or PARs.

15.4 GENERAL INFORMATION

Project personnel (in-house and consultant) who perform FE duties for the Department's construction projects must possess a current FE Level II course qualification through the CTQP. Individual qualifications can be verified by contacting the CTQP Administrator Office:

Phone: (813) 864-2595.

Fax Number: (813) 864-2599.

Mailing address:

CTQP Administrator

4890 West Kennedy Blvd., Suite 300

Tampa, FL 33609

Web site: <http://www.ctqpfloida.com/>

For generic information, email: info@ctqofloida.com

CTQP qualifications are subject to suspension according to the **Construction Training and Qualification Manual (CTQM), Chapter 9, Section 9.7**. CTQP qualifications are subject to disqualification according to the **CTQM, Chapter 9, Section 9.8**

The District Construction Office (DCO) will be responsible for performing the performance reviews and maintaining the information put in the FE Qualification Performance System Database for their District, and the State Construction Office (SCO) will monitor and review this program statewide to ensure consistency in implementation and to evaluate the effectiveness of the program.

15.5 FREQUENCY OF EVALUATIONS

The minimum frequency of the DFEO IA Review evaluations will be 30% of the active personnel within the District annually. A list of all active FE Level II personnel within the Districts will be input in a random number evaluating system to identify the personnel that will be evaluated. Each District Final Estimates Manager (DFEM) will send their report to the State Final Estimates Engineer (SFEE) including the number of active personnel and the number of personnel that will be evaluated.

15.6 SCHEDULING EVALUATIONS

The DFEO's staff will perform the IA Review evaluations of active personnel qualified in FE Level II that are scheduled throughout a calendar year to meet the minimum frequency as specified in **Section 15.5** of this **Manual**.

These proposed evaluations should be scheduled with the FE Level II qualified person by contacting the individual or their supervisor and scheduling a date and time.

DFEO IA Review Personnel performing evaluations will use the Final Estimates Qualification Performance Report (FEQPR). (See **Appendix 15-1**.) They will also use the Final Estimates Independent Assurance Review Checklist to guide them through the evaluation. (See **Appendix 15-2**.)

15.7 EVALUATIONS

15.7.1 DFEO EVALUATIONS

The goal of DFEO IA Reviews and PARs is to provide an improvement tool for all qualified personnel preparing final estimates for Department construction projects.

Each Resident Engineer shall ensure that all Training Identification Numbers (TINs) for the FE Level II qualified personnel are submitted to the DFEO, as soon as qualifications are met.

Personnel will be evaluated on performance, proficiency, and observation in preparing and maintaining the FE Package in accordance with Department policies and procedures.

Process of evaluations for the DFEO is described in the sections below:

15.7.1.1 IA REVIEW PROCESS

- a. Schedule with the RO.
- b. Conduct IA Review at the RO and/or on the construction project.
- c. Conduct on active contracts.
- d. Complete the FEQPR Form.
- e. Focus on performance of the preparation and documentation of a FE package.
- f. Use the **FE Checklist** with emphasis on the following areas:
(See **Appendix 15-2**)
 1. Earthwork
 2. Asphalt
 3. Concrete
 4. Penalties assessed
 5. Contract administration, such as liquidated damages, alternative contracts, bonuses
 6. Assessments of deficiencies, adjustments, and disposition of samples

An observational IA Review evaluation will be considered satisfactory if all items on the **FE Checklist (Appendix 15-2)** are completed correctly. Unsatisfactory evaluations will be submitted to the personnel listed on the IA report. FE Level II qualified persons may be reviewed on one project or on several projects at the same time; whether procedural errors are found on one or more projects, the DFEO may give only one (1) strike. (See Section **15.8**.)

Refusal to participate or lack of cooperation in the IA Review evaluation is sufficient reason to consider an evaluation unsatisfactory.

15.7.1.2 POST AUDIT REVIEWS

- a. Conduct PARs at the DFEO
- b. Conduct on Certified Projects (See **Chapter 4, Section 4.3** of the **Review and Administration Manual** for minimum requirements)
- c. Focus on performance of the preparation and documentation of a FE package.
- d. Conduct using the **FE Checklist** with emphasis on the same areas in **Section 15.7.1.1(f)**. Also refer to the **FE Guidelist** for more information regarding FE reviews.

The PAR report will list all procedural errors found during the review and will be sent to the RO/Consultant Office, the Project Engineer/Project Manager, the PA, and the Contract Support Specialist (CSS) on the project, who are required to respond to any findings in the PAR Report within 14 working days, so that these same errors

will not occur in the future. (See **Chapter 4, Section 4.3**, and **Attachment 4-5, Sample Post Audit Review for Certified Final Estimates Report**, in **Chapter 4** of this *Manual*.)

15.8 NON-COMPLIANCE/STRIKE

A strike is an area of non-compliance or an unsatisfactory evaluation where a FE Level II qualified person fails to adhere to Contract Documents, policies and procedures. Each IA Review evaluation that is unsatisfactory, or that documents non-compliance in one or more areas, will result in one (1) strike. (See **Appendix 15-2**.)

A strike will be given on IA Reviews only, and only if a person has a procedural error(s). Strikes will not be given on PARs. However, the PAR Reports should provide positive and/or negative feedback so that the final estimates process continues to show improvements and positive outcomes (complete FE packages without any errors).

15.9 IA REVIEW EVALUATION

The DCO personnel conducting an IA Review will report all observations on the FEQPR. (See **Appendix 15-1**.)

All IA reviews will be input into the Final Estimates Qualification Performance System (FEQPS). Any reported issues of non-compliance will be noted in FEQPS with an explanation of the strike. The DFEO designated personnel will continuously update the FEQPS. (See **Section 15.11**)

15.10 DOCUMENTATION

15.10.1 FEQPS Database

The FEQPS resides within the SCO's Systems Section and is updated by the DFEO designated personnel. The TIN for all active FE Level II qualified personnel will be entered into a database, as provided by the DFEO.

The DFEO IA Review Personnel shall promptly document evaluation results to support the FEQPR, in accordance with **Section 15.10.2**.

Each DFEO will prepare a **FEQPR** or the SFEE. This report will include the goals set forth for that calendar year. It will also include the results achieved from the previous year and goals for the upcoming year.

15.10.2 FINAL ESTIMATES QUALIFICATION PERFORMANCE REPORT

The FEQPR, as shown in **Appendix 15-1**, shall be accompanied with the FE IA Review Checklist, (see **Appendix 15-2**). The FEQPR is used to document the results of the IA Review evaluation by entering information into the database within five (5) working days after the IA Review. The evaluations will be based on the FE IA Review Checklist (See

Appendix 5-12). The DFEO will keep and maintain these evaluations for a minimum of five (5) years.

15.11 SUSPENSIONS

Qualified IA Review Personnel will file an FEQPR with errors/strikes notated and the FE Level II qualified person shall be subject to the following actions per individual strike:

1st Strike Documented on the FEQPR and entered into the FEQPS database. Submit the report to the individual, supervisor, and the Resident Engineer (RE).

If a subsequent observation is documented satisfactory, in accordance with **Appendix 15.2**, “no additional strike” will be added. The first strike will remain in the FEQPS database for two years. If no other strikes occur during the two year period, the first strike will then be removed from the FEQPS database.

2nd Strike Documented on the FEQPR and entered into the FEQPS database. Submit the report to the individual, supervisor, the RE, and the SFEE.

The RE will provide additional training for the individual in question when a second strike occurs.

If a subsequent observation is documented satisfactory, in accordance with **Appendix 15-2**, “no additional strike” will be added. The first and second strikes will remain in the FEQPS database for a two year period commencing on reporting of the second strike. If no other strikes occur within the two year period, the first and second strikes will then be removed from the FEQPS database.

3rd Strike Suspension of qualification: Should a 3rd strike be given and determined valid, within two (2) years from the 1st strike, the DFEM will discuss the matter with the DCE and inform the SFEE for initiating suspension of an individual’s FE Level II qualifications. This will be documented in the FEQPS database, and a copy sent to the CTQP by e-mail for entry into the CTQP database. The FEQPR will also be submitted to the individual, the supervisor, RE, DCE, and SFEE.

A suspension decision may be appealed by the individual to the SFEE. The SFEE will review the appeal and the resulting decision is final. The individual will not be able to perform FE Level II functions until re-qualification is attained. The individual must attend the FE Level II qualification course, and pass the written examination through the CTQP in order to become re-qualified. Once the individual passes the FE Level II course examination, all previous strikes will be removed from the FEQPS database. At that time, the individual will begin with a clean evaluation status until the next evaluation by the DFEO.

Note: In general, if the individual receives less than three (3) strikes within the two year limit, all strikes will be removed after the end of December of the second year.

APPENDIX 15-1

FE QUALIFICATION PERFORMANCE REPORT

Employee Information

Employee Name (or): _____
Employee TIN: _____
District: _____
Resident Office: _____

Independent Assurance Information

Project #: _____
Date: _____
Time: _____
Location: _____

Attachments: _____

Areas Reviewed:

Earthwork: _____

Asphalt: _____

Concrete: _____

Penalties Assessed: _____

Contract Administration: _____

Assessment of deficiencies, _____
Adjustments & disposition of samples

Summary of Observation:

The Discrepancy was: _____

If results were unsatisfactory, indicate action taken:

- 1st Action: results documented. (cc: Employee, and Resident Engineer (RE)).
- 2nd Action: results documented. (cc: Employee, RE, and District Final Estimates Manager (DFEM))
- 3rd Action: written summary of observations sent to Employee, District Construction Engineer (DCE), RE, and DFEM for disposition.

Independent Assurance Observer

Date

Original: Data entry Tallahassee
cc: See above Other: _____

APPENDIX 15-2

FINAL ESTIMATES INDEPENDENT ASSURANCE REVIEW CHECKLIST

DFEO CHECKLIST DURING CONSTRUCTION, POST CONSTRUCTION, AND CERTIFIED JOB

The criteria for DFEO checklist include:

I . Contract administration

II . Earthwork Items

III. Asphalt Items

IV . Concrete a) Foundations (piling, drill shaft, etc.)

b) Substructure

c) Superstructure

V . Warranties

APPENDIX 15- 2
FINAL ESTIMATES INDEPENDENT ASSURANCE REVIEW CHECKLIST
DFTO CONSTRUCTION CHECKLIST FOR IA

ITEMS CHECKED	References	P	F	N/A	REMARKS	
I. Contract Administration						
a. Contract, Contract Plans , Special Provisions, etc. available	CPAM CH 5, R&AM					
b. Plan Summary Boxes						
1. Price adjustments applied and shown ; any additions/deletions	Specifications					
2. Final quantities summarized as they are completed	CPAM CH 5					
3. Cross-reference all data that supports the final quantity	CPAM CH 5					
4. Penalties assessed and shown						
5. Thickness adjustments applied and shown	Specification 285					
6. Method of payment verification (Plan Quantity, Final Measure, or Lump Sum)						
7. All Final Estimates documentation and back up in EDMS or Collaboration Site, as applicable.						
c. Final As-Built Plans						
1. Updated as project progresses a. All field revisions shown. Marked up in red font. All EOR revisions placed appropriately per Section 5.12 of CPAM. b. Voided sheets identified and in the correct order.	CPAM CH 5					
2. Bridge Plans:						
a. Load Ratings recorded on appropriate forms and submitted with Plans	CPAM CH 5					
b. Drill Shaft Inspection records submitted with Plans	CPAM CH 5					

c. Pile Driving Log folders certified and submitted with Plans	CPAM CH 5			
d. Contract Time:				
1. All time extensions reflected on summary contract time	CPAM CH 5			
2. Overrun in contract time reflected in LDs/disincentive charged on monthly or progress estimate	CPAM, Specifications			
3. Deduction made for late contract execution	Specifications			
4. Time charges summarized				
e. Contractor's Certifications Payment based on Certification of Quantities/Worksheets/Monthly Estimates received monthly:				
1. Bituminous Certification and/or Worksheets (All Projects)				
2. Fuel Worksheets (LS/DB Projects). For Conventional, done in Site Manager				
3. Asphalt quantity certifications, certified for each pay item (Conventional Projects). Worksheets turned in for LS/DB projects				
4. MOT Signs, etc. & Traffic Markings Certifications (Conventional Projects only)				
5. Traffic Marking Certification (Worksheet for Conventional & LS/DB Projects)	CPAM CH 5			
6. All other monthly certifications pertaining to the progress estimate and monthly payment				
f. Materials				
1. Check all deficiencies, in Certification of Materials as they are turned in. (Have you addressed this on pay estimates?)				
II. Earthwork				
a. Pre-construction work				
1. If cross-section waiver requested, was it approved prior to clearing & grubbing?				

2. Bench level loop performed and verified.	CPAM CH 5			
3. Errors in vertical control data detected in the initial benchmark loop verification field notes with results forwarded to contractor?				
4. Has verification of original terrain line been recorded appropriately prior to any clearing & grubbing?				
5. Errors in cross-sections detected, and was contractor notified?				
6. If paying by truck measurements, has a list of trucks with their assigned numbers and their certified capacity been provided?	Per Specs			
b. During Construction work:				
1. Have all temporary benchmarks used during subsoil excavation been properly referenced using the Final Measurement Miscellaneous form? Is there any reference to the original Bench Mark (BM)?				
2. If extra depth subsoil encountered and excavated, have calculations been made for accurate payment for additional material?	CPAM CH 5, Specifications			
3. Is subsoil excavation that exceeds the limits of authorized excavation been paid for and explained for each occurrence?				
c. After Completion of Earthwork:				
1. Have all adjustments to embankment due to subsoil excavation overruns or underruns been made?				
2. Have final measurements/counts been summarized, checked & documented on the appropriate Site-Source-Record?				
3. Have all changes to final earthwork been indicated on final plans, and/or cross-section plots				

_____ included?				
III. Asphalt				
a. Conventional Projects				
1. Does the lot submittal package have all supporting documentation?	CPAM CH 11			
2. Does the tonnage tickets match the Contractor's Quality Control reports?				
3. Unit price adjustment for each composite pay factor percentage adjustment? Paid on the monthly estimate				
4. Asphalt Pay item paid per Specifications (up to 105% adjustments) made on the monthly estimate	Section 234, 285, 287, 334, 337,339			
5. Have penalties been assessed?	Specifications			
6. Roadway As-Built Pavement data form submitted appropriately into the Construction Automated Reporting System (CARS) System	CPAM CH 5			
b. Alternative Contracts (LS and DB)				
1. Is there a LOT Submittal Package for each adjustment to the lump sum price based on the composite pay factor worksheet?				
2. Fuel & bituminous adjustments in accordance with Contract?				
3. Are monthly payments shown on the Schedule Of Values (SOV)?				
4. Spread Rate Adjustments up to 105% per Specifications?				
5. Any Penalties? Have they been assessed per Specifications?				
IV- Concrete (Foundations, Substructure, and Superstructure)				
a. Records				
1. Are low strength failure penalties calculated according to Contract?				
2. Have adjustments to unit price been made?				

b. Piling verification:				
1. Authorized pile lengths provided?				
2. Payments for performed holes, buildups, splices, re-drives, cutoffs, and set checks documented in pile driving records and related to payment according to specifications?				
c. Drill Shafts				
1. Contract Documents reviewed for applicable specifications related to payments?				
V - Warranties				
a. Asphalt pavement	Section 337-338			
b. Bridge deck exp. joints, other bridge warranties	Section 401			
c. Bearing devices	Section 401			
d. Bridge electrical/ lighting system	Section 401			
e. Coatings	Section 401			
f. Concrete pavement	Section 355			
g. Design Build warranty (complete project)				
h. Bridge drainage system	Section 401			
i. ITS warranty				
j. Landscape installation	Section 580			
k. Post construction warranty (add-on)				
l. Traffic markings	Section 707-713			
m. Performance turf	Section 570			
n. Building warranties.				