CHAPTER 15

FINAL ESTIMATES PERFORMANCE REVIEWS

15.1 PURPOSE

In keeping with the Department's mission, vision, and values, Final Estimates (FE) Performance Reviews (PR) will be conducted in the Districts. The District Construction Office (DCO) personnel will conduct Independent Assurance (IA) Reviews to evaluate the performance of Final Estimates (FE) Level II qualified personnel in preparing a FE in accordance with Department policies and procedures. Post Audit Reviews (PARs) will also be performed when a Final Estimate Project is certified and turned in to the District Final Estimates Office (DFEO).

15.2 REVIEW PERSONNEL

IA Review and PAR staffs are Department personnel from the DFEO. Resident Offices will **NOT** perform IA or PARs. All IA and PAR Personnel must hold a current FE Level II qualification from the Construction Training Qualification Program (CTQP).

15.3 GENERAL INFORMATION

A Final Estimates IA and a Final Estimates ~~Post Audit Review~~PAR are improvement tools. Project personnel (in-house and consultant) who perform FE duties for the Department's construction projects must have a current FE Level II course qualification through the CTQP. Individual ~~Q~~qualifications can be verified by calling the CTQP Administrator Office at (813) 864-2595 or call (813) 864-2673. The Fax Number is (813) 864-2595. The mailing address is: CTQP Administrator; 4890 West Kennedy Blvd., Suite 740, Tampa, FL 33609, or ~~by checking on their~~ web site, http://www.ctqpflorida.com/.
Periodic IA Review evaluations are intended to assure continuance of qualifications used on construction projects by Districts, Consultants, and Resident Offices (RO). The IA Review is done on qualified individuals using the ***Final Estimates Independent Assurance Review Checklist*** (see ***Appendix 15-2***). PARs are done at the DFEO when a Certified Final Estimates Project is received by either a Consultant or In-House.

CTQP qualifications are subject to suspension according to the ***Construction Training and Qualification Manual (CTQM), Chapter 1, Section 1.9.11***.

The number of evaluations for each qualification area will be a percentage of the active qualified personnel in that qualification area for one year, per ***Section 15.4***.

The ~~District Construction Office (~~DCO~~)~~ will monitor and review the FE Qualification Performance System Database (The IA Process Computer Program) for their District, and the State Construction Office (SCO) will monitor and review this program, statewide, to ensure consistency in implementation and to evaluate the effectiveness of the program.

15.4 FREQUENCY OF EVALUATIONS

The frequency of the DFEO IA Review evaluations will be determined by a statistically representative evaluation of active qualified FE Level II personnel. The minimum frequency will be 30% of the active personnel annually.

15.5 SCHEDULING EVALUATIONS

The DFEO's staff will perform the IA Review evaluations of active personnel qualified in FE Level II that are scheduled throughout a calendar year to meet the minimum frequency as specified in ***Section 15.4***.

DFEO IA Review Personnel performing evaluations will use the Final Estimates Qualification Performance Report (FEQPR), (see ***Appendix 15-1***), also available on the website. They will also use the Final Estimates Independent Assurance Review Checklist to guide them through the evaluation, (See ***Appendix 15-2***).

15.6 EVALUATIONS

15.6.1 THE DFEO EVALUATIONS

The goal for the DFEO IA Review and the PAR is to serve as an improvement tool for all qualified personnel performing FE duties.

Starting in December 15, 2003, each Resident Engineer shall ensure that all Training Identification Numbers (TINs) for the FE Level II qualified personnel are forwarded to the DFEO, as soon as qualifications are met.

Personnel will be evaluated on the performance, proficiency, and observation, in preparing and maintaining of the FE Package in accordance with the CTQP FE Level II Training Class.

Process of evaluations for the DFEO is as follows:

15.6.1.1 IA PROCESS

a) Scheduled with the ~~Resident Office (~~RO~~)~~.
b) Conducted at the RO and/or on the construction project.
c) Conducted on currently active contracts.
d) Conducted using the FEQPR Form.
e) Focused on performance of the preparation and documentation of a FE package.
f) Conducted using the FE Check list with emphasis on the following areas: See ***Appendix 15-2***.

1. Earthwork
2. Asphalt
3. Concrete
4. Assessments of deficiencies, adjustments, and disposition of samples.
5. Contract ~~Administration~~ administration such as, l~~L~~iquidated d~~D~~amages, a~~A~~lternative c~~C~~ontracts, b~~B~~onuses, etc.

The evaluation will review performance, proficiency, and/or observation. The evaluation by observation will be considered satisfactory if all items on the checklist (see ***Appendix 15-2***) are completed correctly. For unsatisfactory evaluations, in addition to the personnel listed on the report, copies will be distributed as specified in the report. A qualified person may be reviewed on one project or on several projects at the same time, and if procedural errors are found on one or any of the projects, the DFEO may give only one (1) strike.

Refusal to participate or lack of cooperation, in the IA evaluation will be a sufficient reason to consider an evaluation unsatisfactory.

15.6.1.2 Post Audit Reviews (PARs)

a. Conducted at the DFEO
b. Conducted on all Certified Projects.
c. Focused on performance of the preparation and documentation of a FE package.
d. Conducted using the FE Check list that was used on the IA Review to see if all was done right and with emphasis on the following areas: See ***Appendix 15-2***.

1. Earthwork
2. Asphalt
3. Concrete
4. Assessments of deficiencies, adjustments, and disposition of samples.
5. Contract a~~A~~dministration such as, l~~L~~iquidated d~~D~~amages, a~~A~~lternative c~~C~~ontracts, b~~B~~onuses, etc.

The PAR evaluation will review performance, and proficiency, using the IA Checklist that was performed on the qualified person before the project was certified and turned in. If procedural errors are found the report will list ~~any or~~ all the errors, and the report will state that the responsible parties are required to ~~answer~~ respond to the issue(s) on the report for resolution ~~and~~ so that future errors will not recur. If the PAR is satisfactory and the product is well prepared, the report should be sent out to all responsible parties ~~for a job well done~~. See ***Chapter 4*** of this manual, ***section 4.3***. Also see ***Sample Post***

Audit Review for Certified Final Estimates Report, ***Attachment 4-5*** in ***Chapter 4*** of this manual.

15.7 NON-COMPLIANCE/STRIKE

A strike is an area of non-compliance or unsatisfactory evaluation where a qualified FE Level II person fails to adhere to contract documents, policies and procedures (Review & Administration Manual (R&AM), Preparation & Documentation Manual (P&DM), Computation Methods for Design, Construction, and Final Estimates (CMDCFE) Handbook, Construction Project Administration Manual (CPAM), and the FE Guidelist).

Each evaluation that is unsatisfactory, or that documents non-compliance in one or more areas, will result in one (1) strike. See ***Appendix 15-2***.

A strike will be given on IA Reviews only, and only if a person has a procedural error(s). Strikes will not be given on PARs. However, the PAR reports should provide positive and or negative feedback so that the ~~F~~final ~~E~~estimates ~~P~~process continues to show positive outcomes (excellent packages and without any errors).

15.8 REVIEW EVALUATION

The DCO personnel conducting an IA Review will report all observations on the FEQPR. See ***Appendix 15-1***.

In case of non-compliance (see ***Section 15.10***), the non-compliance will be noted in the Final Estimates Qualification Performance System (FEQPS) Database. The DFEO designated personnel will continuously update this database system.

15.9 DOCUMENTATION

15.9.1 FE Qualification Performance System (FEQPS) Database

The DFEO IA Process Computer Program is called the FEQPS Database. It will be formulated and reside with the SCO and will be updated by the DFEO designated personnel.

This system with all active qualified personnel's Training Identification Number (TIN) will be entered into a database as provided by the DFEO.

The DEFO IA Review Personnel shall promptly document these results to support the FEQPR, in accordance with ***Section 15.9.2.1***.

Each DFEO will prepare a ***System's Report*** for the State Final Estimates Manager (SFEM). The report will refer to the goals set forth for that calendar year. It will also include the results achieved and goals for the upcoming year.

15.9.2 FINAL ESTIMATES QUALIFICATION PERFORMANCE REPORT (FEQPR)

~~15.9.2.1 DFEO QPR~~

The FE-QPR, as shown in ***Appendix 15-1***, shall be accompanied with the FE PR Checklist, (see ***Appendix 15-2***).

The FE-QPR will be used to document the results of the evaluation by entry into the database and will be completed within five (5) working days after the IA Review. The evaluations will be kept and maintained by the DFEO for a minimum of five (5) years. The evaluations will be based on the FE PR Checklist, (see ***Appendix 15-2***).

15.10 SUSPENSIONS

In order to maintain qualification status, IA Review Personnel from the DFEO will evaluate FE Level II personnel. A DFEO qualified IA Review person will file an FEQPR (see **Appendix 15-1**), stating that he/she has witnessed a qualified FE Level II person perform FE duties (see ***Appendix 15-2***) in an erroneous manner (by not following Contract Documents, and FDOT procedures), and the qualified FE Level II person shall be subject to the following guidelines per individual qualification:

1st Strike — Documented on the FEQPR and entered into the FEQPS database. Send copy to individual, supervisor, and the Resident Engineer (RE).

When a qualified DFEO IA person notes the first strike on an individual, the strike will be on one or more of the topics mentioned in ***Section 15.6*** of this chapter. See ***Subsections 15.6.1.1***. Also, the first strike can be given to one individual who is working on one or several projects at the same time.

If a subsequent observation is documented satisfactory, in accordance with ***Appendix 15.2***, “no additional strike” will be added. The first strike will still remain in the FEQPS database for two (2) full years, and if no other strikes occur during the two (2) year period, at the end of the two (2) years, the first strike will then be deleted.

Note: A year will be considered to run only from January through December.

2nd Strike — Documented on the FEQPR and entered into the FEQPS database. Send copy to individual, supervisor, the RE, and the SFEM.

A strike will be on one or more of the topics mentioned in ***Section 15.6*** of this chapter. See ***Subsections 15.6.1.1***. When an IA is done, and when procedure errors are found, a strike would be given to a qualified person per review.

The RE should consider additional training for the individual in question when a second strike occurs.

If a subsequent observation is documented satisfactory, in accordance with ***Appendix 15-2***, “no additional strike” will be added. The first and second strikes will still remain in the FEQPS database for the two (2) year limit, and if no other strike occurs within the two (2) year period, at the end of the two (2) years, the first and second strikes will then be deleted.

3rd Strike

Suspension of qualification: Should the 3rd strike be determined valid, within two (2) years (from the 1st strike), the District Final Estimates Manager (DFEM) will discuss the matter with the DCE and inform the SFEM for initiating suspension of an individual’s qualification. This will be documented in the FEQPS database, and a copy sent to the CTQP by e-mail or letter for entry into the CTQP database. Copies will also be sent to the individual, the supervisor, RE, DCE, and SFEM.

This suspension decision may be appealed by the individual to the SFEM. The SFEM’s decision is final. The individual will not be able to perform Level II functions until re-qualification is attained. The individual must attend the FE Level II qualification course, and pass the written examination through the CTQP, in order to become re-qualified. When the individual passes the FE Level II course examination, all previous strikes will then be deleted from the system. At that time, the individual will begin with a clean evaluation status until the next evaluation by the DFEO.

Note: In general, if the individual receives less than three (3) strikes within the two (2) year limit, all strikes will then be deleted after the end of December of the second full year.

APPENDIX 15-1

F.E. QUALIFICATION PERFORMANCE REPORT

Employee Information

Employee Name (or):_____
Employee TIN:_____
District:_____
Resident Office:_____

Independent Assurance Information

Project #:_____
Date:_____
Time:_____
Location:_____

Attachments: _____
_____

Areas Reviewed:

Earthwork:_____

Asphalt:_____

Concrete:_____

Penalties Assessed:_____

Contract Administration: _____

Assessment of deficiencies, _____
Adjustments & disposition of samples

Summary of Observation:
_____
_____

The Discrepancy was:_____

If results were unsatisfactory, indicate action taken:

- ☐ 1st Action: results documented. (cc: Employee, and Resident Engineer (RE)).
- ☐ 2nd Action: results documented. (cc: Employee, RE, and District Final Estimates Manager (DFEM)
- ☐ 3rd Action: written summary of observations sent to Employee, District Construction Engineer (DCE), RE, and DFEM for disposition.

_____ _____
Independent Assurance Observer Date

Original: Data entry Tallahassee
cc: See above Other:_____

APPENDIX 15-2

FINAL ESTIMATES INDEPENDENT ASSURANCE REVIEW CHECKLIST

DFEO CHECKLIST DURING CONSTRUCTION, POST CONSTRUCTION, AND CERTIFIED JOB

The criteria for DFEO checklist are as follows:

I . Contract administration

II . Earthwork Items

III. Asphalt Items

IV . Concrete
a) Foundations (piling, drill shaft, etc.)
b) Substructure
c) Superstructure

V . Warranties

APPENDIX 15- 2 (Updated 6-22-09)

FINAL ESTIMATES INDEPENDENT ASSURANCE REVIEW CHECKLIST

A) DFEO CONSTRUCTION CHECKLIST FOR IA

ITEMS CHECKED	References	P	F	N/A	REMARKS
I. Contract Administration					
a. Contract, comp book, plans, special provisions, etc. available	P&DM, R&AM				
b. Comp Book					
1. Price adjustments applied and shown in comp book, including ~~A~~adjustments / ~~A~~additions	P&DM				
2. Final quantities summarized as they are completed	P&DM				
3. Cross reference all data that supports the final quantity	P&DM				
4. Penalties assessed and shown	P&DM				
5. Thickness ~~A~~adjustments applied and shown	Section 285				
6. Method of payment v~~V~~erification (Plan Quantity, Final Measure, or Lump Sum)					
7. Fuel & b~~B~~it ~~A~~adjustments shown in Comp Book					
c. Final As-Built Plans					
1. Updated as project progresses	P&DM (Ch-4)				
2. Bridge Plans:					
a. Final As-Built Plans Load Ratings recorded on appropriate forms kept with Plans	P&DM (Ch-4)				
b. Final As-Built Plans Drill Shaft Inspection records kept with Plans	P&DM (Ch-4)				
c. Final As-Built Plans Pile Driving Log Book/ Records recorded appropriately.	P&DM (Ch-4)				
d. Contract Time:					
1. All time extensions reflected on summary contract time	P&DM (Ch-3)				
2. Overrun in contract time reflected in	CPAM,				

LDs/disincentive charged on monthly or progress estimate	Specifications				
3. Deduction made for late contract execution	Specifications				
4. Time c~~C~~harges summarized					
e. Contractor's Certifications Payment based on Certification of Quantities/Invoice(s) received monthly:					
1. Bituminous Certification (All Projects)					
2. Fuel Certification (LS/DB Projects)					
3. Asphalt quantity certifications for each pay item (Conventional Projects)					
4. MOT Certifications (Conventional Projects)					
5. Pavement Markings Certification (Conventional Projects)					
f. Materials					
1. Check all deficiencies, in Certification of Materials as they ~~come up~~are turned in. (Have you addressed this on pay estimates?)					
II. Earthwork					
a. Pre-construction work					
1. If cross section waiver requested, was it approved prior to clearing & grubbing?					
2. Bench level loop performed and verified.	P&DM-Ch-8				
3. Errors in vertical control data detected in the initial benchmark loop verification field notes~~,~~ with results forwarded to contractor?					
4. Has verification of original terrain line been recorded appropriately prior to any clearing & grubbing?					
5. Errors in cross sections detected, and was contractor notified?					
6. If paying by truck measurements, has a list of trucks with their assigned numbers and their certified capacity been provided?	Per Specs				
b. During Construction work:					
1. Have all temporary benchmarks used during					

subsoil excavation been properly referenced in field book and page number where originally established?					
2. If extra depth subsoil encountered and excavated, have calculations been made for accurate payment for additional material?	P&DM-Ch8, Specifications				
3. Is subsoil excavation that exceeds the limits of authorized excavation been paid for and explained for each occurrence?					
c. After Completion of Earthwork:					
1. Have all adjustments to embankment due to subsoil excavation overruns or underruns been made?					
2. Have final measurements/counts been summarized, checked & documented on the appropriate Site-Source-Record?					
3. Have all changes to final earthwork been indicated on final plans, and/or cross-section plots included?					
III. Asphalt					
a. Conventional Projects					
1. Does the ~~L~~lot ~~S~~submittal ~~P~~package have all supporting documentation?					
2. Does the tonnage tickets match the Contractor's Quality Control -reports?					
3. Unit price adjustment for each composite pay factor percentage adjustment?					
4. Spread r~~R~~ate based on Design Mix?	Section 234				
5. Roadway As-Built Pavement data form - entered data into **LIMS**	P&DM (Ch-4)				
b. Alternative Contracts (LS and DB)					
1. Is there a l~~L~~ot s~~S~~ubmittal ~~P~~package for each adjustment to the ~~L~~lump s~~S~~um price based on the composite pay factor worksheet?					
2. Fuel & b~~B~~ituminous a~~A~~djustments in accordance with Contract?					

3. Spread r~~R~~ate a~~A~~djustment in accordance with contract?~~.~~					
4. Spread ~~R~~rate based on design m~~M~~ix?					
IV- Concrete (Foundations, Substructure, and Superstructure)					
a. Records					
1. Are low strength failure penalties calculated according to contract?					
2. Have adjustments to unit price been made?					
b. Piling verification:					
1. Authorized pile lengths provided?					
2. Payments for performed holes, buildups, splices, re-drives, cutoffs, and set checks documented in pile driving records and related to payment according to specifications?					
c. Drill Shafts					
1. Contract documents reviewed for applicable specifications related to payments?					
V - Warranties					
a. Asphalt p~~P~~avement	Section 337-338				
b. Bridge ~~D~~deck ~~E~~exp. j~~J~~oints, etc.	Section 401				
c. Bearing d~~D~~evices	Section 401				
d. Bridge ~~E~~electrical/ ~~L~~lighting ~~S~~system	Section 401				
e. Coatings	Section 401				
f. Concrete p~~P~~avement	Section 355				
g. Design ~~B~~Build ~~W~~warranty (c~~C~~omplete p~~P~~roject)					
h. Bridge d~~D~~rainage s~~S~~ystem	Section 401				
i. ITS w~~W~~arranty					
j. Landscape ~~I~~installation	Section 580				
k. Post c~~C~~onstruction w~~W~~arranty (~~A~~add-~~O~~on)					
l~~L~~. Traffic m~~M~~arkings	Section 707				
m. Performance t~~T~~urf	Section 575				
n. Building w~~W~~arranties, etc.~~....(other)~~					